DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 227 334 CE 035 421

AUTHOR Greenberger, Ellen; Steinberg, Laurence D.
TITLE Part-Time Employment of In-School Youth. An Assessment of Costs and Benefits. Final Report.
INSTITUTION California Univ., Irvine.
SPONS AGENCY Ford Foundation, New York, N.Y.; National Inst. of Education (ED), Washington, DC.
PUB DATE [80]
GRANT NIE-78-0191; NIE-G-79-0148
NOTE 27p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Academic Achievement; Adolescents; *Cost Effectiveness; *Educational Benefits; Employment Experience; Employment Practices; *Employment Problems; High Schools; *High School Students; *Part Time Employment; *Youth Employment
IDENTIFIERS California (Orange County)

ABSTRACT

A study assessed the costs and benefits of learning and of developing part-time employment of in-school youth. During the study, data were collected from a sample of 531 tenth- and eleventh-grade students drawn from an initial pool of 3,100 youngsters attending high schools in Orange County, California. To gather these data, researchers used survey questionnaires, on-site interviews of the adolescents, and interviews with their parents. The research design included both cross-sectional and longitudinal components. Researchers concluded that adolescents who take part-time jobs while in school experience a number of benefits, including development of personal responsibility and acquisition of knowledge about business and consumer matters. However, some of the benefits of working while in school have been overstated. Youngsters who work show no significant changes in their long-term educational or occupational plans. In addition, working entails costs. It can diminish involvement in school activities, is associated with increased absenteeism, and, in some cases, leads to a decline in school performance. Recommendations called for limiting student work to 15 to 20 hours per week, for encouraging youth to take jobs that provide opportunities for learning and contact with adults, and for closer collaboration among educators and employers. (MN)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED227334

FINAL REPORT

Part-time Employment of In-School Youth

An Assessment of Costs and Benefits

Ellen Greenberger
and
Laurence D. Steinberg

University of California
Irvine, California 92717

The research summarized in this report was supported by a grant from the National Institute of Education. Preparation of the report was funded by the National Institute of Education and the Ford Foundation. The authors share equal responsibility for the report. The opinions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the funding agencies.

CE035421

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)
This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

Executive Summary

Since 1940, the proportion of 14- to 16-year-old males who work while attending school has risen by a factor of 5. For females of this age the proportion has risen by a factor of 11. Current estimates indicate that over half of all high school juniors and seniors, and about 30% of all 9th and 10th graders, are employed at any one time during the school year. Over 80% of all high school students will have held a job before graduating. Teenagers who work while attending school are also doing so for greater amounts of time than did their counterparts 40 years ago. More than half of all 16-year-olds in the labor force work more than 14 hours per week.

The emergence of work as a major setting in which adolescents spend significant amounts of time presents special opportunities, as well as problems, for educators committed to helping youth make a successful transition from school to work. To support educators in their efforts, N.I.E. funded a program of research by Ellen Greenberger and Laurence Steinberg, at the University of California, Irvine, through a grant titled: "Early Adolescents at Work: Costs and Benefits to Learning and Development."

Data were collected from a sample of 531 tenth- and eleventh-graders drawn from an initial pool of 3,100 youngsters attending four high schools in Orange County, California. Of this sample, 212 were employed in their first part-time job and 319 had never worked. All employed youngsters were working in "naturally occurring" part-time jobs in the private sector; youngsters employed through school- or government-sponsored programs were excluded. In terms of gender, the study sample was 42.5% female and 57.5% male. In terms of ethnicity, 82.2% were White, 9.6% Hispanic, and 8.2% Black or Asian. In terms of social class (indexed by father's occupation) 24% were professional, 31% white collar, 40% blue collar, and 6% not determined. The study used survey questionnaires, on-site observation of adolescents, and interviews with youngsters and parents. The research design included both cross-sectional and longitudinal components to carefully distinguish worker/nonworker differences which were the consequences of the work experience from differences that existed prior to the work experience. The results of the study provide information on the benefits and costs of adolescent work.

Adolescents who take part-time jobs while in school experience a number of clear benefits. They have opportunities to develop personal responsibility for assigned duties, and they demonstrate measurable gains in self-reliance. Those who work in retail sales and other jobs which require extensive and flexible social interaction learn to deal more effectively with other people. Working also contributes to the acquisition of knowledge about business practices, financial concepts, and consumer matters. Holding a part-time job while in school is associated with an enhanced work orientation that is reflected in a greater ability to persist at a task and to derive pleasure from doing a job well.

Some of the anticipated benefits of working while in shcool have been overestimated, however. The nature of youth jobs is such that adolescents have little opportunity to cooperate with others on joint tasks. They tend to feel that the work they perform does not contribute importantly to the overall functioning of their organization. Young workers perform tasks that make only minimal demands on cognitive skills acquired through schooling, and they perform tasks that do not require substantial new learning. Adolescents who work interact primarily with other young workers; they have little contact with adults who might serve as effective mentors or role models. Youngsters who work show no significant changes in their long-term educational or occupational plans. There is no evidence, moreover, that working deters delinquency.

Working, and in particular, working more than 15-20 hours weekly, also entails costs. Working diminishes involvement in school activities and is associated with increased absenteeism. There is some evidence that working long hours may lead to a decline in school performance. Job stress contributes to an increased use of cigarettes, alcohol, and marijuana. Working adolescents also develop cynical attitudes toward work. Some workers give away goods or services, steal from employers, work while intoxicated, and call in sick when not sick. Working reduces the time adolescents spend with their families, and weakens ties with friends. The jobs held by youth also reinforce occupational sex-stereotypes.

This research on the benefits and costs of adolescent work has three educational policy implications:

1. Educators and counselors should view fifteen to twenty hours per week as a "break-even" point beyond which the costs begin to outweigh the benefits. Youngsters who work many hours a week are no more likely to reap benefits from the experience than those who work fewer hours, but the costs of working go up in direct relationship to the amount of time worked.

2. Educators and counselors should be aware that some jobs are better than others in providing adolescents with opportunities for learning, responsibility, and contact with adults. Retail sales jobs are generally higher on these dimensions than other types of jobs, while cleaning jobs tend to be lowest.

3. If work experience is to become an important force in the education and socialization of young people, educators and employers must begin working in much closer collaboration. At present, for most young people, the workplace serves more as an extension of adolescent culture than as a bridge to adult culture or work roles.

Findings from this research have been disseminated through several channels. First, the research has been published in the popular press. Psychology Today (July 1980) published a major

article on this research, and Seventeen magazine (November 1980) presented a teenager's guide to the workplace based on this study. Second, a counselor's guide to adolescent employment has been developed to help educators advise teenagers who take part-time work. This guide will be published and distributed with the assistance of national associations of educators and counselors. Third, the study has produced a policy paper published by the Department of Labor in a recent review of youth employment and training policies. Fourth, and finally, the principal investigators of this project have published scholarly articles that should influence the future course of research on this topic.

Introduction

In this report we examine the short-term costs and benefits of part-time employment of youth during the school year. The report deals solely with youngsters who hold part-time jobs in the private sector, and whose jobs have not been created through government or educational interventions. That is, our concern is with employment in "naturally occurring" jobs, and not with youth employment programs, work experience programs or career education programs.

The study which forms the core of this report is based on an investigation of suburban 10th and 11th grade high school students who were holding their first formal job. By far the majority of youngsters studied are Caucasian and come from working class and middle class homes. The jobs they hold are concentrated in the retail and service sectors. The conclusions we reach about the costs and benefits of working should not be generalized to urban and minority youngsters; youngsters from disadvantaged socioeconomic backgrounds; or to youngsters whose jobs have been designed specifically to promote educational ends, job skill development, or future employability. Although it is important to evaluate the consequences of such programs for youth, the consequences of employment in "naturally occurring" jobs also need to be understood. Of those high school students who work, the vast majority do so in the naturally occurring workplace.

Background

The policy context. Educators, social critics, and policy makers concerned with youth have called repeatedly for the earlier and more deliberate integration of adolescents into the world of work. Criticism of the high school and concern over high rates of youth unemployment have dominated policy discussions of the state of adolescence in this

country since the 1970's, and early work experience has been proposed as a partial solution to the education, socialization, and employment problems of the young. The case for work experience was vehemently argued in several major youth policy statements of the 1970's (the report of the President's Science Advisory Committee, 1973; the report of the National Commission on the Reform of Secondary Education, 1973; and the National Panel on High School and Adolescent Education, 1976) and has surfaced once again in more recently commissioned policy statements (the report of the Carnegie Council on Policy Studies in Higher Education, 1980; the report of the National Commission on Youth, 1980). These blue-ribbon panels have argued that earlier work experience may help American youth better make the transition to adulthood.

Four assumptions about the workplace underly recommendations for work experience during adolescence: (1) work settings provide young people opportunities to gain experience in taking responsibility for themselves and to assume responsibility for tasks which affect others; (2) work settings provide opportunities for young people to encounter adults who will serve as teachers, socializers, and friends; (3) work settings provide opportunities for learning new skills that are not taught in school and for practicing skills previously acquired through formal schooling; and (4) work experience facilitates the development of healthy attitudes toward work.

Although the major policy efforts in the area of youth employment have involved the creation of employment and training programs for low-income and minority youth, efforts also have been taken to ease the entry into the workplace of young people generally. Chief among them are measured designed to increase flexibility of school schedules so

that students interested in working may spend part of their day outside of the school. Additionally, many schools award academic credit through work-study programs for youngsters' experiences in the labor force. More recently, the notion of lowering the minimum wage (or creating a dual minimum) has once again been raised as a possible means of increasing the rate of youth employment.

The social context. Concomitant with policy makers' interest in the earlier integration of youth into the workplace, there has been a dramatic increase in the proportion of in-school youngsters who work and in their hours of work. Since 1940, the proportion of 16-year-old males who work while attending school has risen by 500%; for females of this age, the proportion has risen by a factor of 11. (Comparable increases in employment rates have occurred among 14- and 15-year-olds.) Current estimates indicate that over half of all high school juniors and seniors and about 30% of all 9th and 10th graders are employed at any one time during the school year. Over 80% of all high school students will have held a job before graduating.

The increase in labor force participation of high school youth over the past forty years can be attributed to several different, and mutually compatible, factors. First, it is possible (though undocumented) that adolescents' motivation to work has increased and/or that the social acceptability of youngsters' employment concomitant with schooling has increased. Second, it is possible that the rise in employment among high school students is due to a change in the composition of the population of high school students. Forty years ago many more youngsters left high school before graduation than do so at present; today, students who forty years ago were leaving schools in order to work are remaining

in school and working--a trend that may reflect both the increased value placed on high school graduation and the increased availability of part-time jobs. A third, and related, possible explanation of the increased participation of students in the labor force concerns the growth of the retail and service sectors of the economy; this expansion has resulted in an increased demand for part-time labor. Such part-time jobs are well-suited to high school students for two obvious reasons: they can not work full time, and their financial status (i.e., continuing dependence, to a greater or lesser degree, on their parents) does not require them to draw a full-time salary.

Not only are proportionately more school-going teenagers working than 40 years ago, but those who work are doing so for greater amounts of time than did their counterparts previously. In 1970, for example, more than half of all 16-year-old students in the labor force worked more than 14 hours per week. For females, the proportion was only slightly lower. The majority of teenagers who work are employed in retail or service jobs, although many also work in agriculture, manufacturing, and clerical positions.

The research context. Most research on adolescent employment has focused on its long term economic consequences (e.g., does part-time employment during the school years affect future employment prospects or earnings?). The short term effects, in contrast, have been largely unexplored. Positive effects of work experience on learning, responsibility-taking and socialization have been widely assumed, as noted earlier, but have been undocumented empirically. The potential costs of working, on the other hand, have been overlooked entirely.

There are three reasons to suspect that employment may have some adverse effects on young people. First, working may take time away from

other important activities such as schooling, family life, and relationships with friends. Second, the types of jobs typically available to youngsters may foster negative attitudes toward working. Third, because adolescence is a period of rapid and dramatic life change, the additional demands of a job may produce health and behavioral problems.

In 1978, the authors of this report initiated an extensive study of the immediate costs and benefits of employment during high school. The research, which has been supported by the National Institute of Education and the Spencer Foundation investigated the impact of part-time employment on schooling and learning, psychological and social development, attitudes and values toward work, health, and anti-social behavior.

Data were collected from a sample of 531 tenth and eleventh graders attending four high schools in Orange County, California.[1] Of this sample, 212 were currently employed in their first part-time job or had held, in addition, only one summer job, and 319 youngsters had never worked. "Working" was defined as regular employment of at least three hours per week for a non-family member. The selection criteria for "workers" were intended to allow us to focus on the impact of the first formal work experience. At the time of data collection, members of the study sample had been working an average of about nine months, for an average of 20-24 hours per week, in the following types of jobs: food

---

[1] The study sample was drawn from an initial pool of 3100 youngsters -- all tenth and eleventh graders present in their schools on the day of testing. Comparison of demographic data from the 3100 youngsters with similar data based on the SMSA from which the schools were selected suggests that the initial survey sample was quite similar to the population from which it was drawn (SMSA #9, Orange County, California). Within the final study sample, there are, however, certain differences between workers and youngsters who have never worked: the group of workers contains proportionately more males, fewer Blacks and Asians, and more eleventh graders than the group of non-workers.

service (35%), manual labor (15%), retail sales (13%), cleaning (10%), clerical (9%), skilled labor and operatives (6%), recreation aides and ushers (3%), hucksters (3%), child care (2%), newspaper delivery (2%), health aides (1%), and educational aides (1%).

Some important demographic characterisitcs of the study sample are tabled in Appendix A. We call attention to the fact that 82% of the respondents are White, 10% Hispanic, and 8% Black or Asian. The distribution by family social class is 24% professional, 31% white collar, and 39% blue collar. Appendix A also describes the subsamples of workers and non-workers in terms of ethnicity and class. For the most part, ethnic and class differences between the workers and non-workers are not substantial.[2] The absence of social class differences in employment rates is mirrored at the level of job type. There are no systematic differences in the social class background of youngsters who hold different types of jobs (see above).

Several methodological features of the study are important to note. First, multiple methods of data collection were used to insure a broad perspective on the problems under scrutiny. These methods included survey questionnaires, on-site observation of adolescents at work, and interviews with working youngsters and their parents. Second, the design of the research included both cross-sectional and longitudinal, or panel, components. In both components, careful attention was paid to distinguishing worker/non-worker differences which are the consequence

[2]Although it appears that Black and Asian youngsters are underrepresented in the labor force, this interpretation is subject to question. "Workers" in this study are in fact first-time workers, and "non-workers" have never held a job; we do not know, therefore, if the underrepresentation of Blacks and Asians among "workers" is in fact due to their having held previous job(s) and thus not qualifying for inclusion in the study.

of the work experience from differences which are operative prior to the work experience and part of the differential sorting or selection of youngsters into those who enter the labor force and those who do not.[3] In discussing the results of this study, we describe some consequences of working emphatically and others equivocally. In the first category are findings on which cross-sectional and longitudinal data, and data obtained from different methods, converge. In the second category are findings which are detected by some methods but not others. Readers interested in a more detailed treatment of the findings, procedures, and analyses are referred to research reports listed in Appendix B.

---

[2] In cross-sectional analyses, possible consequences versus causes of employment were identified by differentiating among workers, non-workers seeking employment, and non-workers not seeking employment. A worker/non-worker difference that also significantly distinguishes between job-seekers from non-seekers suggests that the worker/non-worker difference is not a result of working, but a factor that predisposes youngsters to work. On the other hand, a worker/non-worker difference that differentiates workers from job-seekers, but not job-seekers from non-seekers, suggests a consequence, rather than an antecedent, of working. In longitudinal analyses, the strategy for identifying consequences of working was as follows: youngsters who were initially in our non-working sample (and were tested in 1978) were tracked over the ensuing year (and re-tested in 1979). About half of these youngsters entered the part-time labor force for the first time and were working at the time of the second testing. We are able to pinpoint changes which are attributed to working by examining change over time on the outcome measures of interest, while controlling for initial differences on those measures between youngsters who entered the labor force and those who did not.

Findings

Does the workplace provide the benefits attributed to it? We discuss this question in terms of four concerns of work experience advocates: the contribution of work to the development of responsibility; intergenerational contact; learning; and occupational values and plans.

1. Responsibility

   (a) Part-time jobs provide young people with opportunities to exercise and develop some aspects of personal responsibility. However, we find little evidence of workers' exceeding minimal performance requirements of their jobs. The majority of youngsters report that they are punctual and that they fulfill assigned duties, but few report that they do appreciably more than what is expected of them. Nonetheless, youngsters who work show gains in self-reliance, as measured by a standardized trait and attitude inventory.

   (b) Jobs provide little opportunity to experience cooperation and interdependence on tasks. Young workers spend little time actually assisting other workers in a common task. They tend to feel that the work they perform does not contribute importantly to the overall functioning of the enterprise or organization.

   (c) Substantial numbers of adolescent workers feel that their work benefits others. Despite perceptions that they are peripheral to the organization, 44 in 100 young workers feel that the way they do their jobs affects the well-being of "a lot of people."

Interestingly, youngsters who work feel better able to be of help to others when they are at work than when they are at school. Relevant research reports, listed in Appendix B, are 4, 6, 9, 10, and 14.

2. Contact with Adults

(a) Contact with adults in the workplace is of limited scope. Jobs generally fail to put youngsters in touch with adults who serve as teachers or friends. Youngsters receive very little formal instruction from adults, perhaps because the activities young people perform at work do not require substantial new learning. The picture with regard to social interaction is comparable. Only a small proportion of time on the job is spent talking with an adult supervisor or co-worker, and only about 10% of workers feel that they would want to discuss a personal problem or other non-work issues with an adult from work. Moreover, relationships with adults are confined to the workplace and rarely extend beyond its boundaries.

Relevant research reports are #9, 10, 11, and 14.

3. Learning

(a) Working may contribute to the acquisition of practical knowledge. There is some evidence that workers have more knowledge about business practices, financial concepts, and consumer matters than non-workers. This advantage is most pronounced among academically less-talented students.

(b) Few jobs provide youngsters with opportunities to use cognitive skills taught in school or to acquire new skills. Reading,

writing, and arithmetic computation are infrequent in the jobs typically held by adolescents. Clerical jobs provide the greatest opportunity for use of school-taught skills, but the average adolescent who works spends less than 7% of his or her time using such skills. Youngsters spend most of their time in activities which do not have a large cognitive component (e.g., in activities that involve cleaning and carrying). This is the case in virtually all jobs. As noted earlier, adolescents' jobs also offer little ongoing on-the-job training. It appears that youngsters either come into the workplace with the required skills in hand or learn them in a very short period of time.

(c) Youngsters who work in certain jobs may learn to deal more effectively with other people. Jobs which require non-stereotyped social interaction (e.g., retail sales positions in which the youngster plays a part in directing the interaction) provide opportunities for learning how to interpret the needs of others and how to adjust one's behavior to meet those needs.

Relevant research reports are #5, 6, 8, and 14.

4. Work-Related Attitudes, Values and Plans

(a) Youngsters who work develop an enhanced work orientation. Compared with non-workers, workers describe themselves as better able to persist at a task, resist distraction, and derive pleasure from doing a job well.

(b) Working leads to some changes in job values (i.e., the attributes of jobs judged important in choosing a future career), but the changes do not form an easily interpretable picture. Working decreases the importance of exercising authority, as a criterion for choosing an occupation, but increases the importance of exercising creativity for boys and girls alike. Girls who work attach increased importance to earning money and job security. Boys who work attach increased importance to being able to make their own decisions on the job.

(c) Working does not alter youngsters' long-term occupational or educational plans. Neither the level of expected attainment, measured in terms of occupational prestige and years of schooling, nor the anticipated adult occupation, is affected by early work experience.

Relevant research reports are #4 and 6.

Does working have unanticipated costs? We discuss this question in terms of five potentially negative consequences of working: costs to schooling, costs to health, the socialization of occupational deviance and related attitudes, attentuation of family and peer activities, and the reinforcement of occupational sex-stereotypes.

5. Costs to Schooling

(a) Working diminishes youngsters' involvement in school. Students who work spend less time on their studies, are less involved in extracurricular activities, and say that they enjoy school less than youngsters who do not work. These effects are particularly pronounced among youngsters who work 15 hours or more per week.

(b) There is a tendency for workers to be absent from school more often than non-workers.

(c) There is some evidence that working leads to a decline in academic performance. Youngsters who work 15 hours or more per week are most likely to show a decline in grades. It is likely that the decline in school performance is a consequence of the weakening of school involvement noted above.

Relevant research reports are #4 and 5.

6. Costs to Health

(a) There is no evidence that working per se has negative effects on self-reported physical or psychological well-being. There is some evidence, however, that exposure to higher levels of job stress leads to increased frequency of psychological symptoms among girls.

(b) There is substantial evidence that working per se is associated with increased cigarette, alcohol, and marijuana use. Use of these substances tends to increase with increasing hours of employment.

(c) Youngsters who work under stressful conditions are more likely than other youngsters to make frequent use of cigarettes, alcohol, and marijuana. Aspects of job stress that exact costs to health are poor environmental conditions, autocratic supervision, impersonal work environment, low wage structure, perceived meaningiessness of job, and conflict of work with other roles.

(d) Income differences between workers and non-workers, and among workers who experience different amounts of job stress, are not sufficient to account for observed differences in substance abuse.

Relevant research reports are #4 and 12.

7. Occupational Deviance and Related Attitudes

(a) Approximately 60% of adolescent first-time workers report having committed some form of theft or other type of deviance within their first nine months of employment. The most common forms of deviance are giving away goods or services for nothing or for less than the market price, calling in sick when not sick, taking things from the employer or from co-workers, and working while intoxicated or under the influence of drugs.

(b) Working may promote the development of cynical attitudes about the intrinsic value of work. Youngsters who work are more likely than non-workers to denigrate the meaningfulness of work and the satisfactions that can be gained from working hard. Evidence for this effect is stronger among youngsters from blue-collar and white-collar family backgrounds than among youngsters from higher socioeconomic backgrounds.

(c) There is no evidence that working deters young people from delinquency. Workers and non-workers do not differ in their reported frequency of engaging in criminal or status offenses.

Relevant research reports are #4 and 13.

8. Costs to Family and Peer Activities

(a) Youngsters who work spend less time with their families than youngsters who do not work, and girls, but not boys, become less close to their parents as a result of working.

(b) Youngsters who work spend no less time with friends from school and home, but closeness to friends may decline nevertheless. The

workplace, furthermore, is not a source of significant new peer friendships.

Relevant research reports are #4, 7, and 9.

9. Reinforcement of Occupational Sex-Stereotypes

(a) The adolescent workplace is characterized by sex-stereotyping of jobs. Boys are far more likely than girls to be employed as manual laborers and skilled laborers and operatives, whereas girls are far more likely than boys to be employed as clerical and child care workers. Even within the same occupational category (e.g., food service), boys and girls perform different tasks. The patterns of sexual segregation in the adolescent workplace closely resemble those found in the adult work force nationally.

(b) Even within the restricted range of jobs and wages available to adolescents, boys earn higher hourly pay than girls. The pay differential in jobs is greatest in those jobs characterized by a high proportion of male employees. Since boys also work for more hours per week than girls, boys' earnings are considerably higher than girls'.

The relevant research report is #10.

Conclusions and Recommendations

1. The benefits of working during the in-school years have been overestimated. Youngsters who work may gain in practical knowledge and have opportunities for modest levels of responsibility-taking, and youngsters who work in certain jobs may develop more advanced social skills. However, adolescents do not typically learn new skills on the job, practice school-taught skills, form meaningful relationships with adults, nor engage in high levels of responsibility taking or social cooperation. Moreover, the costs of working have been underestimated. The most serious costs include increased use of cigarettes, alcohol, and marijuana; exposure to stressful conditions at work which appear to exacerbate substance abuse; declines in school envolvement and academic performance; exposure to various forms of occupational deviance; and increased cynicism about the intrinsic value of work. This assessment of costs and benefits is based on a study of first-time workers who had been employed, on the average, for nine months. Whether the benefits and costs endure, or whether other, delayed effects emerge, are issues we cannot address.
2. Although we did not study adolescents enrolled in youth employment and training programs or career education programs, others have, and we can comment briefly on similarities between our findings and theirs. (The differences between our findings and the findings of those studies, in contrast, are uninterpretable, for reasons of population differences, as noted in the Introduction.) Three areas of convergence are noteworthy: (a) There is no evidence that

working either in planned programs or in "naturally occurring" jobs contributes either directly or indirectly to the enhancement of school-taught skills; (b) working speeds the acquisition of information about the world of work; and (c) working may engender more positive work habits.

3. In general, youngsters who work many hours a week are no more likely to reap benefits from the experience than youngsters who work for fewer hours. However, the costs of working are directly related to the amount of time youngsters spend in the workplace.
4. As in the adult world of work, some adolescents' jobs are "better" than others. It is true that jobs vary in the degree to which they provide youngsters with opportunities for learning, responsibility-taking, and contact with adults; however, the degree of variation is not great. Retail sales jobs generally are higher on these dimensions than other types of jobs, whereas cleaning jobs tend to be lowest. Despite differences among jobs in opportunities for learning, responsibility-taking, and contact with adults, we find no systematic differences in worker outcomes as a function of these job differences. For example, youngsters' scores on a measure of self-reliance are unrelated to the degree of responsibility they are able to exercise on the job. One explanation for the absence of relations between job differences and worker outcomes is that the differences among jobs are not <u>great enough</u> to have different effects. Another explanation is that the differences among jobs are less important than their <u>similarities</u>. Thus, the general demands, opportunities, and constraints associated with holding any job may be responsible for the worker/non-worker differences

identified in this report. For example, all jobs demand punctuality and may, as a consequence, enhance the development of responsibility; and all jobs, when they exceed a certain number of hours per week, may infringe upon time devoted to schoolwork.

5. Child labor laws vary across states with respect to the hours young people are permitted to work and even to some extent with respect to the types of jobs they may hold. The evidence of this study and related research suggests that hours/time provisions are poorly enforced but that there is, in fact a need to restrict the amount of time young people spend in the labor force. In view of several findings indicating that the costs of employment are closely tied to the amount of time youngsters spend in the workplace, further research is needed to determine in more specific terms how much and when high school students should work. Working four hours on a Saturday afternoon may have different effects from working four hours on a school night.

6. There is currently lively debate on the merits of lowering the minimum wage for young workers in order to provide more job opportunities for youth. Economic considerations prevail in this debate, but there are other relevant issues. One rationale for lowering the minimum wage is that it will reduce the high degree of unemployment among economically disadvantaged and minority youth. Although a lower minimum wage undoubtedly will open up new jobs for this group, it will also create jobs for youngsters who do not have a strong economic need to work. In view of the findings of this study concerning educational, psychological, and social costs associated with working, we suggest that employment policies targeted

specifically at those who need employment the most may be preferable to policies affecting all youth.

On a related point, it seems possible that lowering the minimum wage also will induce youngsters to spend more time in the workplace than they presently do. Because youngsters work primarily to earn spending money, they will have to work more hours in order to realize the same earnings. As noted repeatedly in this report, the costs of working go up as youngsters spend more time in the workplace.

7. A number of respected social scientists have argued that work experience during adolescence will facilitate the transition of young people into adulthood. This may be the case for some adolescents in some jobs. But for many young people, the workplace serves more as an extension of adolescent culture than as a bridge to adulthood. In many respects, the workplace for young people is distinctively adolescent in nature. Most youngsters work mainly in the company of their peers. Their supervisors are often only a few years older than they. Adolescent workers seldom find significant adult models in the workplace. Job income, moreover, is spent primarily on items that are highly salient in the peer culture: cars, records, extra clothes, cigarettes, alcohol, and marijuana. In contrast, relatively few youngsters save their earnings and even fewer save money for long-term objectives that will be relevant to their adult lives (e.g., further education). The place of working in reinforcing the peer culture is suggested, too, by the fact that a good deal of occupational deviance is centered around strengthening ties to other adolescents (a prime example is young workers' giving away goods and services to their friends). Finally, while the

level of initiative and responsibility permitted adolescent workers may allow them to practice relevant skills already acquired elsewhere, the requirements of most adolescents' jobs are not sufficient to provide growth in these areas.

8. If work experience is to be an important force in the education and socialization of young people, it can not be left to the private sector without guidance from those primarily concerned with youth development. We can not encourage work experience on the assumption that jobs provide opportunities for learning, responsibility-taking, and contact with adults if these opportunities typically are not present. Private sector employers are not in business to facilitate youth development. If the workplace is to be a viable setting for socializing young people and facilitating their transition to adulthood, it has to be constructed with those goals in mind.

9. Several questions require further research. The question, "Do different jobs yield different worker outcomes?" needs more intensive exploration before we can assume (as our findings tentatively indicate) that the answer is "no." The planful design of jobs to promote youth development can not proceed rationally without such information. In addition, it is important to determine the effects of working in "naturally occurring" jobs on youth from less advantaged family backgrounds. It is possible, for example, that for such youngsters, the gains associated with employment are greater than those uncovered here. In view of the likely diminution of government funding for youth employment programs, we need to know whether the private sector can effectively assume functions heretofore performed by the public sector.

APPENDIX A

Demographic Characteristics of the Study Sample

Grade	Total Sample (n = 531)	Workers (n = 212)	Non-Workers (n = 319)
10	42.94%	33.96%	48.90%
11	57.06%	66.04%	51.01%
Sex			
Male	42.56%	48.58%	38.56%
Female	57.44%	51.42%	61.44%
Ethnicity			
White	82.20%	85.38%	80.06%
Hispanic	9.66%	10.38%	9.18%
Blacks and Asians	8.15%	4.24%	10.76%
Social Class (by Father's Occupation)			
Professional	24.29%	25.47%	23.15%
White-Collar and Management	30.70%	31.13%	30.40%
Blue-Collar	39.17%	38.68%	39.50%
Missing	5.84%	4.72%	6.59%

APPENDIX B

Project-Related Publications

Conceptualization of the Problem

1. Steinberg, L. and Greenberger, E. The part-time employment of high school students: A research agenda. Children and Youth Services Review, 1980, 2, 159-183. Reprinted in R. Rist (Ed.), Confronting Youth Unemployment in the 1980's: Rhetoric versus reality. New York: Pergamon, 1980.

2. Steinberg, L. Whither the workplace? The problems and promises of work experience for adolescents. In J. Simon and D. Stipek (Eds.), Exit age: Reconsidering compulsory education. NY: Academic Press, in press.

Project Summaries

3. Greenberger, E. and Steinberg, L. Part-time employment of in-school youth: A preliminary assessment of costs and benefits. In A review of youth employment problems, programs and policies, Vol. 1, The Youth Employment Problem: Causes and Dimensions (Ch. 13). Washington, D.C.: The Vice President's Task Force on Youth Employment, U.S. Department of Labor, 1980.

4. Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Garduque, L., Ruggiero, M., and Vaux, A. Effects of early work on adolescent development. Manuscript submitted for review.

Effects of Work on Schooling and Learning

5. Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Garduque, L., and McAuliffe, S. High school students in the labor force: Some costs and benefits to schooling and learning. Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, in press.

Effects of Work on Occupational Plans and Values

6. Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Vaux, A., and Ruggiero, M. Effects of early work experience on adolescent occupational socialization. Youth and Society, in press.

Psychological and Social Development

7. Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L., Vaux, A., and McAuliffe, S. Adolescents who work: Effects of part-time employment on family and peer relations. Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 1980, 9, 189-202.

8. Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Jacobi, M., and Garduque, L. Working: A partial antidote to adolescent egocentrism. Journal of Youth and Adolescence, in press.

9. Greenberger, E. and Steinberg, L. The workplace as a context for the socialization of youth. Journal of Youth and Adolescence, in press.

10. Greenberger, E. and Steinberg, L. Early work experience: Socialzation for the status quo? Manuscript submitted for review.

11. Steinberg, L. and Greenberger, E. The transition from adolescence to adulthood: The contribution of part-time work. In F. Monks (Ed.), Ontwikkelngspsychologische Bijdragen (Developmental Issues). Nijmegen, The Netherlands: Dekker & Van de Veqt, 1980.

Health

12. Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L., and Vaux, A. Adolescents in the workplace: Health and behavioral consequences of job stress. Developmental Psychology, in press.

Occupational Deviance

13. Ruggiero, M., Greenberger, E., and Steinberg; L. Occupational deviance among first-time workers. Manuscript submitted for review.

The Naure of Work Environments

14. Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L., and Ruggiero, M. A job is a job is a job...or is it? Behavioral observations in the adolescent workplace. Sociology of Work and Occupations, in press.

15. Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., and Ruggiero, M. Assessing job characteristics: When perceptual and objective measures don't converge. Manuscript submitted for review.

Popularizations

16. Cole, S. Send our children to work? Psychology Today, July 1980, 44-70.

17. Tartaglio, D. Your job: Does it really pay off? Seventeen, November 1980, p. 148 and ff.

Brochures for Students and Guidance Counselors

18. Adolescent Work Project. A Guide to the teenage workplace, 1980.

19. Adolescent Work Project. Teenagers and work: A guide for counselors, 1980.